AUDIOVISUAL ACCESSIBILITY IN PERUVIAN CINEMA: AN ANALYSIS OF SUBTITLING FOR THE DEAF IN A NATIONAL FILM

Edwin Eduardo Sagastegui-Toribio1
Diana Judith Palma Briceño2
Anali Arismendis Mogollón3
Ana Cecilia Gonzales Castañeda4
Diana Magcelene Lozano Arredondo5
Mirtha Giovanna Montoro Ponce6
Miguel Angel Medina Lescano7
Bertha Ulloa8

ABSTRACT

Objective: This study aims to analyze the compliance with the UNE 153010:2012 standard in the subtitles of the trial version of the film ¡Asu Mare! 2.

Method: A descriptive design with a qualitative approach was employed. Data were collected using an analysis form and observational techniques.

Results and Discussion: The findings indicate that all subtitles related to "Visual Aspects" adhered to the standard. In terms of "Character Identification," 48 subtitles fully complied, 21 partially complied, and only 1 did not comply. Regarding "Sound Effects," 9 subtitles fully complied, 5 partially complied, with no major errors detected. For "Contextual Information and Voice Over," 38 elements adequately complied, 8 partially complied, and only 2 did not comply correctly. In the "Music and Songs" category, 18 elements met the standard, 5 partially complied, and 1 contained a significant error. Overall, a minimal number of errors were observed across the five aspects analyzed, indicating a high level of adherence to the standard.

Research Implications: Accessible subtitling enables individuals with hearing impairments to access audiovisual content. Practically, subtitlers should not only identify and categorize characters in the audiovisual product but also include crucial information about sound effects to ensure comprehensive understanding. Theoretically, this study lays the groundwork for further exploration into factors such as age and the degree of hearing impairment.

Keywords: Standard, Film, Deaf, Translation.

---

1 Universidad Cesar Vallejo, Trujillo, Perú. E-mail: esagasteguito@gmail.com
Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2230-9378

2 Universidad Cesar Vallejo, Trujillo, Perú. E-mail: dianajudith03@outlook.com
Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4671-4554

3 Universidad Cesar Vallejo, Trujillo, Perú. E-mail: analiarism@gmail.com
Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2632-6001

4 Universidad César Vallejo, Trujillo, Perú. E-mail: lagrenganita@gmail.com
Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2704-5597

5 Universidad César Vallejo, Trujillo, Perú. E-mail: dlozanoar@ucvvirtual.edu.pe
Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6079-9588

6 Universidad César Vallejo, Trujillo, Perú. E-mail: mmontoro@ucvvirtual.edu.pe
Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5763-97757

7 Universidad César Vallejo, Trujillo, Perú. E-mail: mmedinal@ucv.edu.pe
Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9813-6712

8 Universidad César Vallejo, Trujillo, Perú. E-mail: bulloa@ucv.edu.pe
Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3438-937
ACESSIBILIDADE AUDIOVISUAL NO CINEMA PERUANO: UMA ANÁLISE DE LEGENDAGEM PARA SURDOS EM UM FILME NACIONAL

RESUMO

Objetivo: Este estudo tem como objetivo analisar a conformidade com a norma UNE 153010:2012 nos subtítulos da versão de teste do filme ¡Asu Mare! 2.

Método: Foi empregado um desenho descritivo com abordagem qualitativa. Os dados foram coletados por meio de um formulário de análise e técnicas de observação.


Implicações da Pesquisa: A legendagem acessível possibilita que pessoas com deficiência auditiva tenham acesso ao conteúdo audiovisual. Na prática, os legendadores devem identificar e categorizar não apenas os personagens do produto audiovisual, mas também incluir informações cruciais sobre os efeitos sonoros para garantir uma compreensão completa. Teoricamente, este estudo estabelece as bases para uma exploração mais aprofundada de fatores como idade e grau de deficiência auditiva.


ACCESIBILIDAD AUDIOVISUAL EN EL CINE PERUANO: UN ANÁLISIS DE LA SUBTITULACIÓN PARA SORDOS EN UNA PELÍCULA NACIONAL

RESUMEN

Objetivo: Analizar el cumplimiento de la norma UNE 153010:2012 en los subtítulos de la versión prueba de la película ¡Asu Mare! 2.

Método: Se adoptó un diseño descriptivo con enfoque cualitativo. Se utilizó una ficha de análisis y la observación para recolectar los datos.

Resultados y discusión: Los resultados muestran que todos los subtítulos correspondientes a los "Aspectos Visuales" cumplían con la normativa. En relación con la "Identificación de Personajes", 48 subtítulos cumplían por completo, 21 de manera parcial y solo 1 no cumplía. En cuanto a los "Efectos Sonoros", 9 cumplían completamente, 5 de manera parcial y sin contener errores graves. Para la "Información Contextual y Voz en Off", 38 elementos cumplían adecuadamente, 8 de forma parcial y solo 2 no cumplían correctamente. Dentro de la categoría "Música y Canciones", 18 elementos cumplían con la norma, 5 de manera parcial y 1 presentaba un error significativo. En resumen, se encontró una cantidad mínima de errores en los cinco aspectos analizados, lo que sugiere un alto nivel de conformidad con la normativa.

Implicaciones de la investigación: La subtitulación accesible permite a las personas con discapacidad auditiva el acceso a material audiovisual. Desde el punto de vista práctico, los subtituladores deberán identificar y categorizar no solo los personajes del producto audiovisual sino también los efectos sonoros con información crucial para el buen entendimiento del producto. Desde el punto de vista teórico, se han sentado las bases para profundizar en aspectos como la edad y el grado de discapacidad auditiva.

Palabras clave: Norma, Película, Sordo, Traducción.

RGSA adota a Licença de Atribuição CC BY do Creative Commons (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).
1 INTRODUCTION

For cinema to achieve the worldwide recognition that it enjoys today, some previous discoveries were indispensable (Uriarte, 2020). In this way, the seventh art was born and developed. In the 19th century, silent cinema appeared and relied on additional elements such as mime. Today, we have witnessed a remarkable advance in the audiovisual product, surprising with the achievements achieved. However, the incorporation of sound and music added complexity to the film experience for deaf people (Rodríguez, 2003).

An estimated 7.6% of the Peruvian population, or 232,136 people, have hearing difficulties (INEI, 2017). It is crucial to highlight that the needs of this community are different from those who do not face these difficulties. Access to audiovisual media, such as television, film and video games, presents significant challenges for these people. It is therefore essential to reduce the barriers that hinder their access to these means as soon as possible. A proposed tool to address this situation is subtitling (Pereira, 2015).

In recent years, there has been a significant increase in the availability of Subtitling for the Deaf (SPS) in the audiovisual sector, driven by social initiatives that have promoted the creation and distribution of this essential tool (Arnáiz, 2012). In addition, some governments have taken measures to address this problem and ensure equitable access, although with mixed results (Tamayo, 2016). For example, in Peru, the absence of adequate captioning for people with hearing disabilities hinders their access to films and series, negatively affecting their entertainment experience.

The great responsibility lies with the audiovisual translator, who must ensure the transmission of a precise and high quality message to the target audience, complying with all the aspects specified in the UNE 153010:2012 Regulation, which is still relevant today (Bocanegra, 2018). Although much remains to be done to achieve full integration and accessibility that respect the rights of the community, especially in relation to the various services that society offers (Lobato, s.f.), significant progress is being made. The goal is to transform subtitled cinema into an accessible and enjoyable experience for everyone. It is crucial that this population can fully experience all the emotions transmitted in films, series, novels and other audiovisual media (Rodríguez, 2003).

If professionals are not aware of these regulations, or if many of them do not even know them, this could lead to an inadequate transmission of the message. As a result, people with hearing difficulties may feel disoriented when consuming the audiovisual product.
Thus, the following research problem was formulated: Which of the aspects mentioned in UNE 153010:2012 are adequately met in the subtitles of the trial version of the film Asu Mare! 2?

This study is justified by its purpose of instructing audiovisual translators regarding a regulation in force since 2012, which is critical for the inclusion of a large number of individuals with hearing difficulties. It also seeks to encourage the application of this regulation in future translations, serving as a detailed compendium in each relevant aspect. One of its objectives is to urge the Peruvian government to develop its own regulation or to adopt the Spanish Standard in all communication services. As an example, in Spain, Movistar provides the 5S service, focused on the dissemination of accessible audiovisual content. In parallel, in Argentina, audiovisual professionals have established the inclusive platform TEILÚ, available free of charge to the entire community, in order to guarantee inclusion in all communication areas.

In addition, this work has allowed us to examine various analysis sheets used, which has provided us with a clear and precise understanding of the areas in which some translators have failed and of the areas that require improvement in future deliveries of audiovisual products. Therefore, our proposal focused on the subtitling of the film under analysis, having as a general objective to analyze compliance with the UNE 153010:2012 regulations in the subtitles of the trial version of the film Asu Mare!. In addition, specific objectives were raised, such as analyzing the different dimensions of the aforementioned standard.

2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

According to the literature specialized in translation, Audiovisual Translation (TAV) has experienced a remarkable growth in the last two decades, as highlighted by Orrego (2013), who highlights that both dubbing and subtitling have been subject to intense scrutiny in this field. In addition, Orrego (2013) mentions that in response to social demands new modalities have emerged, such as audio description, among others. On the other hand, Martínez (2004) conceptualizes TAV as a form of translation that communicates information through two channels (acoustic and visual), where semiotic codes are combined to give rise to meanings. Regardless of the means of transmission, the signs can be both verbal and non-verbal, as García (2018) points out.

The rise of dubbing dates back to the early era of sound cinema at the beginning of the last century, when the prevailing need to disseminate films in different countries and in
different languages arose. According to Nicolae (2018), dubbing is defined as a creative process of adaptation that involves replacing the soundtrack in the original language with an equivalent in the target language. This involves replacing the original dialogs with versions previously translated and recorded in the target language. On the other hand, Richar (2008) characterizes the dubbing as a process that encompasses the labial synchronization, categorization and harmonization of the duration of the statements, which implies a substantial modification and adaptation of the film. Unlike subtitling, dubbing requires the participation of several agents, including a translator, an adjuster, one or more dubbing studio directors, various dubbing actors, and technical sound specialists. One of the challenges inherent in this modality is the possible loss of naturalness in the translated dialogs (Bartoll, 2015).

In recent years, there has been a notable increase in the production of audiovisual products, which has led to the adoption of various strategies to facilitate their accessibility to people with visual impairments. This upward trend has led to the enactment of legislation that establishes quality standards and criteria in this domain. Among these regulations, the UNE Standard 1530 (2005) stands out, which conceptualizes audio description as a communicative resource aimed at countering the visual limitations of people, thus enabling universal accessibility to all types of content. Audiodescription comprises the translation or explanation of the action so that visually impaired recipients can fully grasp the content, allowing them to understand the plot not only through sound, but also through the information provided about visual events during the reproduction of the audiovisual material (Heir, 2013). Belmonte (2013) conceptualizes it as a system that compensates for the lack of visual perception through sound narratives fundamental to the understanding of narrative development.

Consequently, audio description is configured as a form of translation within the context of audiovisual accessibility (Ortuño, 2016), playing a fundamental role in ensuring accessibility not only for people with visual disabilities, but also in enriching cultural communication in society and in promoting personal growth (Rodrigo, 2015). It is imperative to take into account the diversity of the audience for audio description, since vision loss can be both congenital and acquired over time due to the aging process (Bartoll, 2015).

The technique known as voice-over, or voice-over, is a resource used in audiovisual production where the original sound is not eliminated, but is superimposed with a narrative external to the work. This definition is supported by Doane (1985, cited by Góraska, 2015). According to Talaván et al. (2016), this process involves an oral transfer of the original text, where the original audio track is reduced in prominence, allowing a clearer hearing of the target text. Generally, in the meta version, the voice-over starts a few seconds later and finishes...
before the original audio track, which plays in its entirety. Likewise, it is common that only one voice actor participates in the voice-over, as Orrego (2013) points out.

Díaz and Remael (2007), quoted by Malenova (2015), conceptualize subtitling as a translation practice involving the insertion of written text at the bottom of the video to represent dialog and other visual and sound elements. Bartoll (2008) proposes a detailed taxonomy based on previous studies, seeking to offer a comprehensive analytical model of the parameters involved in this translation modality (Arnáiz, 2012).

The inclusion of subtitling for the deaf (SPS) is crucial, although its academic research is limited due to the lack of publications and resources available in university libraries (Martínez, 2012). According to Miquel (2017), the emergence of subtitles in the United Kingdom in 1979, followed by their adoption in Spain and Catalonia in the 1990s, responded to the need to improve the understanding of audiovisual productions by people with hearing difficulties (Neves, 2007).

The Spanish Association for Standardization and Certification (AENOR) established the standards for the SPS in 2003, reflected in the UNE 153010 standard, updated in 2012, with the purpose of defining quality criteria for this practice (Miquel, 2017). This policy, developed and agreed by various stakeholders in the sector, addresses multiple aspects related to subtitling aimed at deaf people.

Visual aspects of captioning, such as the position and format of captions on the screen, must meet certain standards to ensure an optimal viewing experience (Bartoll, 2008). Character identification and subtitling of sound effects are essential to improve understanding of the plot and the viewer experience (Neves, 2007). In addition, the clear and consistent presentation of contextual information and voice-overs is crucial, using specific conventions to distinguish them from other visual and auditory elements (AENOR, 2012).

As for the music and songs, their subtitling is necessary only when they are relevant to the understanding of the plot, and they must follow certain guidelines to ensure accurate and effective representation (Bartoll, 2008). Finally, editorial criteria, such as the division of text into subtitle lines, are important to improve the readability and understanding of the viewer during audiovisual reproduction (Arnáiz, 2012).
3 METHODOLOGY

The research carried out is of an applied type, since it seeks to put into practice established theories to analyze the compliance with the UNE 153010:2012 standard in the subtitles of the film "Asu Mare! 2".

It uses a case study design to understand and analyze in depth the results and experiences related to compliance with the standard.

The research focuses on this standard (UNE 153010:2012) as the main category, with subcategories including visual aspects, character identification, sound effects, voice-over and contextual information, and music and songs. In addition, a proposal for subtitling for the deaf (SPS) based on these aspects is proposed.

The analysis focuses on the deaf subtitling trial version of the film "Asu Mare! 2", created by Francisco Espinoza Alarcón and published on YouTube on April 1, 2019. The film is a continuation of "Asu Mare!", starring and written by Carlos Alcántara. The investigation analyzed all the subtitles presented in the first 25 minutes of the film. The observation technique, defined by Díaz (2011), was used as a clear and concrete process. An analysis sheet was used for data collection, which facilitated an efficient and simple process.

The object of study of the research was all the subtitles present in the deaf subtitling trial version (SPS) of the movie Asu Mare! 2.

4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Our research focused on evaluating the subtitles for the deaf in the film "Asu Mare! 2" according to UNE 153010:2012, evaluating various visual aspects, character identification, sound effects, contextual information and voice-over, and subtitling of music and songs.
In relation to the visual aspects, the position of subtitles and the position of the sound effects were analyzed: of this first group, of the 108 subtitles evaluated, all met with the norm that indicates that they must be shown centered at the bottom of the screen, both for dialogs and for songs. Of the second group, associated with sound effects position, they were also placed correctly in the upper right part of the screen. This compliance is crucial to avoid confusion and ensure that information is properly interpreted. Each subtitle was assigned to a specific line by character, facilitating the identification of dialogs and improving the understanding of who is talking. This approach was consistent with the findings of Tamayo (2015) and Mejía (2019).

Also, in the analysis of character identification, of the 70 subtitles evaluated, 48 subtitles fully complied with the norm by using accurate colors and labels to differentiate characters. On the other hand, 21 subtitles showed partial compliance, and 1 did not comply at all.
Some techniques used, such as choosing and maintaining colors, using labels, and scripts were critical to avoid confusion, especially with supporting characters and voice-overs. Mejía (2019) and Mas (2017) also found similar challenges in their studies.

As for the sound effects, 14 subtitles were evaluated, of which 9 subtitles had a total compliance and respected the necessary format and synchronization and are related to the results of Bocanegra (2018) since it also applied a correct noun and format in its subtitles analyzed, having a moderate percentage of compliance. However, 5 subtitles partially complied and presented redundancy with visual information or failed to synchronize correctly. On the other hand, there were critical instances such as omission of proper format and incorrect placement of sound effects, which coincided with the findings of Mejía (2019) and Tamayo (2015).

Within the contextual information and voice-over, 48 subtitles were analyzed, of which 38 fully complied with the norm in terms of position, format, and use of italics for voice-over, coinciding with Mejía (2019).

Also, 10 subtitles presented errors, such as omission of relevant contextual information or incorrect use of voice-over scripts coinciding with the findings of Mas (2017).

In relation to music and songs, 24 subtitles were analyzed. 18 subtitles fully complied with the norm in terms of format and marking of songs (one start and one close), in contrast to Mejía (2019) who found 2 only subtitles. Also, 5 subtitles failed to fully comply with the norm due to omissions of musical symbols and music subtitling, which differs from Bocanegra (2018), who, in his research, reveals that half of the total percentage was partially met. Finally, 1 subtitle presented serious errors, not meeting the required song markup.

As a final objective, a proposal of SPS was raised. Based on the analyzes, improvements were proposed for the subtitling criteria, especially in the static position of subtitles, which should be kept at the bottom to avoid confusion. Also in the unification of positions, that is, to place subtitles of sound effects in the same position as those of characters and songs to avoid information losses. As for character identification, full labels should be preferred over abbreviations and consider alternative techniques such as avatars for secondary characters not visible on screen. And in terms of format and synchronization, it must maintain consistency in the format and improve the synchronization of sound effects with visual action.
5 CONCLUSIONS

It was correctly met with the visual aspects as established in the UNE 153010:2012 standard in the subtitles of the trial version of the film Asu Mare! 2, the 108 subtitles analyzed, including the position of sound effects and subtitles and the assignment of different lines in relation to the characters, were found in accordance with the standards established by the regulations.

Analysis of character identification revealed that 48 of the 70 subtitles satisfactorily met the criteria set out in the standard. 21 partially complied and 1 presented a serious error, not complying with the specified aspects. This result indicates that, despite satisfactory overall compliance, there are still areas for improvement in the accurate and consistent identification of characters in the subtitles of the analyzed film.

The analysis of sound effects revealed that, of the 14 subtitles examined, 4 subtitles analyzed, 9 fully complied with the standard, 5 partially complied and no serious errors were found, suggesting that, although there are areas for improvement, in general an acceptable level of compliance with the regulations regarding sound effects in the subtitles analyzed was maintained.

The analysis of the voice-over and contextual information, showed that of the 48 subtitles analyzed, 38 fully complied with the standard, 8 had partial compliance and 2 did not comply due to the omission of contextual information. This indicates that while most subtitles were compliant, there is still scope for improving the inclusion of contextual information in some specific cases.

The subtitling of music and songs indicated that of the 24 subtitles analyzed, 18 complied with the norm, 5 partially complied and 1 presented a serious error. This indicates that although the majority of subtitles evaluated were compliant with regulations, there are still areas of improvement in some specific cases, particularly in the full and accurate fulfillment of the requirements for subtitling music and songs.

REFERENCES


Defensoría del Pueblo. (24 de setiembre del 2020). Defensoría del Pueblo: debe facilitarse el aprendizaje de la lengua de señas peruana y promover la identidad lingüística y cultural de las personas sordas. https://www.defensoria.gob.pe/defensoria-del-pueblo-debe-facilitarse-el-aprendizaje-de-la-lengua-de-señas-peruana-y-promover-la-identidad-linguistica-y-cultural-de-las-personas-sordas/#:~:text=Seg%C3%BAn%20el%20Censo%20Nacional%20de%20las%20personas%20con%20discapacidad.&text=%E2%80%9CEn%20el%20Per%C3%BA%2C,nias%2C%20tienen%20una%20educaci%C3%B3n%20de%20calidad


García, B., y Bolaños, A. (2018). El análisis de la variación lingüística en el doblaje de la serie Jane the Virgin DOI: 10.30827/sendebar.v29i0.6455


Lobato, J. (s.f.). La traducción audiovisual dirigida a personas con discapacidades sensoriales. [Archivo PDF]. https://cvc.cervantes.es/lengua/esletra/pdf/04/049_lobato.pdf


