ACHIEVING SUSTAINABLE QUALITY EDUCATION TARGETS: A CASE STUDY IN EAST JAVA, INDONESIA

Djoko Siswanto Muhartono

ABSTRACT

Objectives: This article aims to analyze the implementation of education policies designed to introduce quality education and identify barriers at the local level. The study focuses on an elementary school in Probolinggo City, East Java Province, Indonesia, to understand how these policies are being executed and the challenges faced.

Methods: Interviews were conducted with various stakeholders, including school representatives, education office officials, and local government authorities. The study utilizes two types of data: primary data collected through interviews and secondary data from existing records and reports.

Results: The findings reveal that the implementation of quality education policies at the primary school level is suboptimal in achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) targets. This inadequacy is primarily due to weak coordination between education offices and schools. The study highlights that this poor coordination affects the ability to achieve inclusive and equitable quality education and support lifelong learning opportunities for all.

Conclusion: The study concludes that the weak working relationship between schools and education offices significantly impacts the sensitivity of education office policies to school needs, thereby hindering the achievement of SDGs at the local level. The results emphasize the need for improved coordination and communication to ensure effective policy implementation. This study contributes to the development of policy implementation theory by providing insights into the sustainable strengthening of educational development strategies and expands theoretical and practical knowledge on local government policy implementation in the context of quality school education in Indonesia under the SDGs framework.

Keywords: Local Government, Policy Implementation, Quality Education, Sustainable Development Goals.

ALCANÇAR METAS SUSTENTÁVEIS DE EDUCAÇÃO DE QUALIDADE: UM ESTUDO DE CASO EM JAVA ORIENTAL, INDONÉSIA

RESUMO

Objetivos: Este artigo tem como objetivo analisar a implementação de políticas educacionais criadas para introduzir a educação de qualidade e identificar barreiras em nível local. O estudo se concentra em uma escola de ensino fundamental na cidade de Probolinggo, província de Java Oriental, Indonésia, para entender como essas políticas estão sendo executadas e os desafios enfrentados.

Métodos: Foram realizadas entrevistas com várias partes interessadas, incluindo representantes da escola, funcionários da secretaria de educação e autoridades do governo local. O estudo utiliza dois tipos de dados: dados primários coletados por meio de entrevistas e dados secundários de registros e relatórios existentes.

Resultados: Os resultados revelam que a implementação de políticas de educação de qualidade no nível do ensino fundamental é insuficiente para atingir as metas dos Objetivos de Desenvolvimento Sustentável (ODS). Essa inadequação se deve principalmente à fraca coordenação entre as secretarias de educação e as escolas. O estudo destaca que essa coordenação deficiente afeta a capacidade de alcançar uma educação de qualidade inclusiva e equitativa e de apoiar oportunidades de aprendizagem ao longo da vida para todos.

1 Hang Tuah University, Surabaya, Indonesia. E-mail: djoko.siswanto@hangtuah.ac.id
Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3367-7707

1 Hang Tuah University, Surabaya, Indonesia. E-mail: djoko.siswanto@hangtuah.ac.id
Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3367-7707
Conclusao: O estudo conclui que a fraca relação de trabalho entre as escolas e as secretarias de educação afeta significativamente a sensibilidade das políticas das secretarias de educação às necessidades das escolas, prejudicando, assim, a realização dos ODSs em nível local. Os resultados enfatizam a necessidade de melhorar a coordenação e a comunicação para garantir a implementação eficaz das políticas. Este estudo contribui para o desenvolvimento da teoria de implementação de políticas, fornecendo insights sobre o fortalecimento sustentável das estratégias de desenvolvimento educacional e expande o conhecimento teórico e prático sobre a implementação de políticas do governo local no contexto da educação escolar de qualidade na Indonésia sob a estrutura dos ODSs.

Palavras-chave: Governo Local, Implementação de Políticas, Educação de Qualidade, Objetivos de Desenvolvimento Sustentável.

ALCANZAR OBJETIVOS SOSTENIBLES DE EDUCACIÓN DE CALIDAD: UN ESTUDIO DE CASO EN JAVA ORIENTAL, INDONESIA

RESUMEN

Objetivos: Este artículo pretende analizar la aplicación de las políticas educativas diseñadas para introducir una educación de calidad e identificar los obstáculos a nivel local. El estudio se centra en una escuela primaria de la ciudad de Probolinggo, provincia de Java Oriental, Indonesia, para comprender cómo se están ejecutando estas políticas y los retos a los que se enfrentan.

Métodos: Se realizaron entrevistas con diversas partes interesadas, como representantes de las escuelas, funcionarios de la oficina de educación y autoridades del gobierno local. El estudio utiliza dos tipos de datos: datos primarios recogidos mediante entrevistas y datos secundarios procedentes de registros e informes existentes.

Resultados: Las conclusiones revelan que la aplicación de políticas de educación de calidad en la escuela primaria no es óptima para alcanzar las metas de los Objetivos de Desarrollo Sostenible (ODS). Esta insuficiencia se debe principalmente a la escasa coordinación entre las oficinas de educación y las escuelas. El estudio destaca que esta coordinación deficiente afecta a la capacidad de lograr una educación de calidad inclusiva y equitativa y de apoyar las oportunidades de aprendizaje permanente para todos.

Conclusiones: El estudio concluye que la débil relación de trabajo entre las escuelas y las oficinas de educación afecta significativamente la sensibilidad de las políticas de las oficinas de educación a las necesidades de las escuelas, obstaculizando así el logro de los ODS a nivel local. Los resultados subrayan la necesidad de mejorar la coordinación y la comunicación para garantizar una aplicación eficaz de las políticas. Este estudio contribuye al desarrollo de la teoría de la aplicación de las políticas al aportar ideas sobre el fortalecimiento sostenible de las estrategias de desarrollo educativo y amplía los conocimientos teóricos y prácticos sobre la aplicación de las políticas de los gobiernos locales en el contexto de la educación escolar de calidad en Indonesia en el marco de los ODS.

Palabras clave: Gobierno Local, Implementación de Políticas, Educación de Calidad, Objetivos de Desarrollo Sostenible.

1 INTRODUCTION

Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) consist of 17 goals and 169 targets and previous research on the implementation of SDGs policies has been carried out by many other researchers, for example: monitoring and evaluation and various local and global efforts to realize a positive vision of basic human needs are met without damaging or degrading natural
systems (World Bank, 2018); The relationship between goals in biophysical, economic and social dimensions in the Sustainable Development Goals (Osborn et al., 2015; Bali Swain & Yang-Wallentin, 2020); changes in ethical obligations to the environment and its elements, so that human-centered sustainable development can be identified appropriate places of sustainability (Blanc, 2015); mechanisms to be adopted and institutionalized at regional and national levels and to review the achievement of sustainable development goals related to inequality reduction and environmental protection (Kopnina, 2016); research on achieving private sector SDGs targets requires reliable measurable indicators (Willis, 2019); harnessing the development of artificial intelligence (Rashed & Shah, 2021; Wu et al., 2018; Turistitiati, 2016); global support for the achievement of objectives and indicators as well as a comprehensive and visionary monitoring and evaluation mechanism of action plans (Vinuesa et al., 2020); changes in management structure are needed to support the strong interdependence of the 17 SDGs and the provision of information to plan, implement, and monitor changes to the SDGs (Nanda, 2016); full realization of women's rights and consensus on exchanges and synergies between economic goals, social environment (Sachs et al., 2019; Sachs, 2012); ongoing advocacy for every purpose to hold authorities accountable (Fukuda-Parr, 2016); monitoring and evaluation of action plans at national, regional and SDGs activity programs by stakeholders (Hadi Darma & Wulandari, 2022; Rizki et al., 2022); the establishment of programs for gender equality and women's empowerment and child protection in cooperation with international organizations such as UNICEF and UN Women. This shows that SDGs Goal fifth has been achieved (Yoshida et al., 2022; Ulfah & Nugroho, 2020). The implementation of the Family Hope Program (PKH) in an effort to achieve SDGs by involving the participation of various government and non-government actors and PKH is able to reduce poverty in line with the goal of the first SDGs (Faturachman et al., 2020; Rachmatullah et al., 2021; Pribadi, 2017; Wahyuni Harahap et al., 2023; Safitri et al., 2022; Jayn, 2021). Indonesia's education policy on the competence of university graduates in primary school content standards must be in line with the concept of Education for Sustainable Development (EfSD) (Hafizah Ghany H, 2018); global plan is needed to finance the Sustainable Development Goals. Achieving the goals of sustainability is essentially a program of investment in physical infrastructure (including renewable energy) and human capital. (Jeffrey et al., 2022)

In addition, the disparity between the Association of Southeast Asian Nations or the Association's member countries to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals of quality education, particularly literacy aged 15-24 years, is described below. from Southeast Asian countries. Nations, or ASEAN for short. The purpose of this distinction is to determine the
achievement of goals based on performance indicators in eleven ASEAN countries, namely Brunei, Indonesia, Cambodia, Lao People's Democratic Republic, Malaysia, Myanmar, the Philippines, Singapore, Thailand, Vietnam and East Timor.

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>State Name</th>
<th>Literacy Rate (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>99,8 (2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>96,8 (2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
<td>98,6 (2019)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Jeffrey et al., 2022

Looking at Table 1 above it can be seen that literacy rate the highest to lowest is the country of Singapore (99,99 %), followed by Indonesia (99,8 %), Brunei Darussalam (99,7 %), Vietnamese (98,6 %), Philippines (98,4 %), Thailand (98,1 %), Malaysia (96,8 %), Myanmar (95,4 %), Lao People’s Democratic Republic (92,5), Camboja (92,2 %), and the last is the country of Timor Leste (83,5 %).

Of the 17 sustainable development goals (SDGs), The study only focused on the fourth goal Quality Education, Ensuring inclusive and equitable quality education, as well as supporting lifelong learning opportunities for all. The research was conducted in Probolinggo City, East Java Province, Indonesia.

The problems faced by the education office and schools in Probolinggo City, how is the implementation of quality education? While the purpose of this study is to describe and explain the realization of the targets of the fourth goal of quality education in Probolinggo City.
2 LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 POLICY IMPLEMENTION

Sabatier and Mazmanian (1983), stating public implementation is understanding what actually happens after a program is implemented or formulated, that is, events and activities that occur after the ratification of public policies, both administrative in nature and efforts to influence certain community programs (Subianto, 2020).

Basically, the policy implementation process is how the policy achieves its goals. There are two ways of implementing public policy, namely direct implementation in the form of programs or through derivative policies or derivative policy instruments. The purpose of implementation is to find out the positive and negative consequences of the policy and find out whether the policy is successful or not. (Dewantari & Kurniawan, 2021).

In relation to the concept of policy implementation, there are several classic implementation theories, namely: Nakamura and Smallwood about complex policy processes and attempt to develop a policy implementation model called environments influencing implementation (Kadji, 2015). Review of policy implementation models based on the theory of George Edward III (Setyawan et al., 2021)

George Edward III's policy implementation theory explains that the biggest problem in public administration is neglect of enforcement or lack of attention to the policy enforcement process. The policy implementation process can be carried out well if there are several aspects, namely: communication; human resources; disposition; and bureaucratic structure.

Communication Aspect. Communication is an important factor and cannot be separated in everything, as well as the position of communication has a vital role in implementing a policy. Resources Aspect. Human Resources, every institution needs human resources as implementors and budget resources that can ensure the implementation of policies is carried out well. Disposition Aspect. Disposition is the attitude and behavior of the policy implementor, meaning that implementing the policy effectively, the implementor must know the policy and be able to implement it. Bureaucracy Structure Aspect. The bureaucratic structure is an aspect that can affect the success rate of the implementation of the last policy, so at this stage it needs to be prepared appropriately and correctly.

Policy Implementation Model Merilee S. Grindle (1980) argues that success in policy implementation depends not only on the influence of policy content and context, but also on adequate planning and financing (Kadji, 2015). The policy content in question includes: the
interest rate is affected; amount of compensation; the extent of the proposed change; place of decision; implementors of programs; related funds. The policy context in question is: power; interest strategies of the actors involved; regime and institution characteristics; compliance and accountability.

Model Van Meter and Van Horn (1975) argues that this implementation process is abstract, is policy implementation activities, which are essentially carried out consciously to achieve high efficiency of policy implementation, are expressed in various variables. This model assumes that policy implementation occurs linearly between policy decisions, public policy implementation, and actions. This model argues that policy effectiveness is influenced by a number of interrelated variables, namely: political norms and objectives/actions and political goals; resources; characteristics of the implementing organization; attitude of the executor; communication between relevant organizations and law enforcement actions; social, economic and political environment (Kadji, 2015)

This research focuses on the implementation of the fourth goal of SDGs policy, namely quality education in the perspective of policy implementation theory from Edwards III, which includes: communication; human resources; disposition; and bureaucratic structure.

2.2 THE CONCEPT OF CONTINUING QUALITY EDUCATION

The concept of continuous quality education is closely related to the work ethic that affects the work outcomes of teachers; work motivation affects the results of teacher work; discipline greatly affects teacher performance; academic supervision affects teacher performance; and work ethic, work motivation, work discipline and academic leadership together affect teacher performance (Ningrat et al., 2020)

In addition, the existence of learning with hybrid learning which has limitations, it is expected that teachers in order to be effective learning organizers, it is necessary to improve learning to be more meaningful, interactive and fun for students (Ganovia et al., 2022; Ansori & Sari, 2020). Understanding of early childhood is important because it can affect the quality of childcare and optimization of early childhood development. In this way, a good discussion of the quality of childcare appropriate to the beginning of the child's mental development can be achieved (Hardiyanti, 2020; Kusainun, 2020).

Development of cognitive field learning outcomes instruments can be developed and used in the evaluation of student learning outcomes (Wirayasa et al., 2021). The higher the cognitive productivity, the higher the performance (Indriyani, 2020; Hasanah, 2020).
Education quality guarantors are divided into three stages, namely, the planning process for improving the quality of the educational process using management information systems; implementation of improving the quality of the learning process using management information systems; evaluate the improvement of learning quality using management information systems; and evaluation of learning quality improvement is carried out in the middle of the semester and the end of the odd semester (Hambali, 2021; Amalia et al., 2020; Andriani & Wakhudin, 2020; Anas, 2021).

The quality of human resources, organizational commitment and work environment have a positive effect and can improve the performance of primary teachers. Professional teachers always have high demands in their work, so with competence and good career development, work results also improve. (Simbolon et al., 2022; Fitriyah & Santosa, 2020; Wardhani & Wijaya, 2020)

The main objective is the principal's management strategy to improve the quality of teaching, which in this case results from a process-based approach. On the other hand, the responsibility of implementing the principal's leadership is still not optimal (Sudrajat et al., 2020; Prasetyono et al., 2020).

Meanwhile, the application of education management with the concept of sustainability has been widely carried out in Indonesia. This concept began to be applied by all state institutions, ministries and departments. There are even some companies, both private and state, that have adopted the management model of continuing education. Sustainability is an educational management theory, an environmental theory and a sustainable development theory itself. In addition, the application of education management with the concept of sustainability has been widely carried out in Indonesia (Fitriandari & Winata, 2021; Widayanti, 2020; Haerullah & Elihami, 2020)

2.3 COORDINATION CONCEPT

Coordination problems are very important, especially in the field of education because they synergize existing resources, so that activities become faster to achieve targets, involving many stakeholders.

The main objective is the principal's management strategy to improve the quality of teaching, which in this case results from a process-based approach. On the other hand, the responsibility of implementing the principal's leadership is still not optimal (Syafizal et al., 2023; Pradhana, 2017; Kusuma et al., 2021; Kustari et al., 2021).
The results showed that the collaboration between the Education and Culture Office of Palu City and the Kana Mapande Community Learning Activity Center (PKBM) went well. The operation, coordination of the use of curriculum and financial mechanisms of PKBM become a unity in relation to Permendikbud number 13 of 2020, and both educational institutions have the same goal, namely improving the quality of education in the place (Firmansyah et al., 2022).

The conclusion of the discussion about coordination, there are several conditions for goals or targets to be achieved, namely: have the same goals; integrated communication system; the presence of adequate financial support; the presence of one action; the presence of a clear division of labor among all parts; the ability of the apparatus in carrying out duties; data synchronization; adequate facilities and infrastructure; placement of apparatus in accordance with its expertise; mastery of information technology; apparatus discipline.

3 RESEARCH METHODS

This qualitative study with a case study was conducted in the city of Probolinggo, East Java Province, Indonesia. The study was conducted with in-depth interviews with 12 informants. Informants were divided into three: local government, education office and schools. There are two types of data: secondary data from local governments and primary data from education offices and primary schools (elementary and junior high), early childhood education (PAUD) and communities represented by education boards and school committees.

Data sources come from: Regional Planning and Development Agency and principals in preschool, elementary, junior high school, and community. The key informants are: Head of Government, Human Development and People's Welfare, BAPPEDA Probolinggo City; Head of Planning, Control and Evaluation, BAPPEDA Probolinggo City; Head of the Education and Culture Office; Secretary of the Education and Culture Office; Head of Division within the Education and Culture Office.

Table 2 presents information on the demographic characteristics of informant representation of local government officials, education offices, principals, school superintendents, communities represented by education boards and school committees.
Table 2

Demographic characteristics of research informants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristic</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>(%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Local government</td>
<td>Planning &amp; development agency officials</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education Agency</td>
<td>Education officials</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>School superintendent</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education units</td>
<td>Head master</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community</td>
<td>Education council</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>School committee</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Man</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Woman</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>45-50</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>51-55</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>56-60</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Prepared by Authors (2024)

Fokus penelitian pencapaian target SDGs: hasil belajar siswa dan angka putus sekolah; pengembangan jiwa masa kanak-kanak dan pola pengasuhan sebelum masuk ke pendidikan dasar, menurut jenis kelamin; akses yang setara bagi semua perempuan dan laki-laki terhadap pendidikan yang berkualitas dan terjangkau; kurikulum berorientasi pada kewirausahaan; membangun dan meningkatkan institusi pendidikan yang peka terhadap gender, anak-anak dan penyandang disabilitas serta menyediakan lingkungan belajar yang aman, tanpa kekerasan, inklusif dan efektif untuk semua; pemberian beasiswa kepada siswa dan pelatihan menurut jenis kelamin; dan meningkatkan penyediaan guru yang berkualitas, melalui kerja sama internasional, dan pelatihan guru.

Research focus on achieving SDGs targets: student learning outcomes and dropout rates; development of the psyche of childhood and patterns of upbringing before admission to primary education, according to gender; equal access for all women and men to quality and affordable education; entrepreneurship-oriented curriculum; build and improve educational institutions that are gender-sensitive, children and persons with disabilities and provide safe, non-violent, inclusive and effective learning environments for all; awarding scholarships to students and training according to gender; and improve the provision of qualified teachers, for example through international cooperation and teacher training.

Data collection techniques by using in-depth interviews for primary data and questionnaires for secondary data as additional explanations of data collected in-depth interviews. Analysis techniques are used content analysis from data collections derived from research subjects and for data reliability, triangulation is carried out, namely data sources by aligning the data obtained with data from other informants until there is no more variation in answers or until the saturation stage. Then set transferability means that it can be applied to other settings. Thus
theoretically, the same results can be obtained in several other settings. Then dependability and reliability are determined if the results are fixed and consistent. The degree of dependency is a criterion for measuring the quality process of research. Finally, confirmability is established as a criterion for assessing the quality of research results with an emphasis on tracking data and interpretation supported by existing data with certainty check techniques.

4 RESULT

The role of the Probolinggo City Regional Planning and Development Agency as a collection of data from several regional apparatus organizations that are directly related to SDGs. Data on the achievement of targets in this agency include the second and third targets as follows:

The second target of the fourth goal of the SDGs by 2030 is to ensure that all girls and boys have access to quality early childhood development and care, pre-primary education, so that they are ready for primary education.

Table 3

Access to development and childcare

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>Base Numbers (Baseline)</th>
<th>Achievement Targets 2022</th>
<th>2023</th>
<th>2024</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Rough Participation Rate (APK) Early Childhood Education (PAUD).</td>
<td>(%)</td>
<td>74.06</td>
<td>91.35</td>
<td>91.85</td>
<td>92.35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Education and Culture Office, 2023

The third target of the fourth goal of the SDGs by 2030 is to ensure that all girls and boys complete free of charge, equal and quality primary and secondary education, leading to relevant and effective learning outcomes.
Table 4

Completion of primary and secondary education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>Base Numbers (Baseline)</th>
<th>Achievement Targets 2022</th>
<th>Achievement Targets 2023</th>
<th>Achievement Targets 2024</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Proportion of children and adolescents: (a) in class 4, (b) Final Level SD/class 6, (c) Final Level SMP/class 9 that achieves minimum capability standards in: (i) read, (ii) mathematics</td>
<td>(%)</td>
<td>98.06</td>
<td>95.63</td>
<td>95.68</td>
<td>95.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Percentage SD/MI Minimally accredited B</td>
<td>(%)</td>
<td>93.85</td>
<td>80.90</td>
<td>80.95</td>
<td>81.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Percentage SMP/MTs Minimally accredited B</td>
<td>(%)</td>
<td>n.a</td>
<td>n.a</td>
<td>n.a</td>
<td>n.a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Percentage SMA/MA Minimally accredited B</td>
<td>(%)</td>
<td>103.42</td>
<td>102.27</td>
<td>102.27</td>
<td>102.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>Rough Participation Rate (APK) SD/MI/Equivalent</td>
<td>(%)</td>
<td>114.21</td>
<td>114.54</td>
<td>114.54</td>
<td>114.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Rough Participation Rate (APK) SMP/MTs/Equivalent</td>
<td>(%)</td>
<td>n.a</td>
<td>n.a</td>
<td>n.a</td>
<td>n.a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>Rough Participation Rate (APK) SMA/SMK/MA/Equivalent</td>
<td>(%)</td>
<td>88,25</td>
<td>82,30</td>
<td>83,70</td>
<td>80,11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>Average length of schooling of the age population ≥15 year</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Education and Culture Office, 2023

Notes: n.a = there is no data because STMA is the authority of the Provincial Government

The results of this study are based on interviews with research subjects, in accordance with the SDGs target planned until 2030. However, not all 10 targets were found, namely the fifth, sixth and seventh targets, because this research was only in the education office and schools, qualitatively, as follows:

4.1 1ST TARGET STUDENT LEARNING OUTCOMES AND DROPOUT RATE

The learning outcomes of several schools in Probolinggo City did not experience a decrease in learning outcomes, but were still stagnant, less jumping in the acquisition of learning scores. Teachers' efforts in improving the quality of education by means of the Scheduled Extra Learning Program (PEPT), without being compensated. Meanwhile, the problem of dropout rates is only case-by-case, and most parents do not notify the school. This condition is as described by the following informant.

Table 5

Average School Learning Outcomes in Probolinggo City

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>School Name</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>SDN Tisnonegaran 1</td>
<td>88,25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>SDN Kebonsari Kulon</td>
<td>82,30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>SMPN 5</td>
<td>83,70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>SMPN 9</td>
<td>80,11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: School of Study Object, 2023
The head of basic education has given directions to school principals to improve the quality of teaching and learning, as well as periodic evaluation of the results and submitted to the school for follow-up. This kind of working mechanism can guarantee the quality of education. The highest value interval of 100, and the average value of 80 and above, belongs to the very good category. Thus, the 1st target of quality education has been achieved in the city of Probolinggo and the problem of school dropout rate is relatively non-existent. One education unit official argued that education as a basic compulsory matter related to public services, can improve quality education. Teachers in the framework of quality education need teacher training on the teaching and learning process; additional teaching outside of class hours.

4.2 THE SECOND TARGET IS ACCESS TO EARLY CHILDHOOD DEVELOPMENT AND PRE-PRIMARY CARE AND EDUCATION TOWARDS PRIMARY EDUCATION

There are differences in the governance of public and private schools in terms of financial resources or teacher salaries as well as human resources (teacher quality), because it will affect the quality of education in public and private schools. This condition can be described by informants, as follows:

Education officials in the field of Early Childhood Education (PAUD) and Non-Formal Education (PNF) stated that there are still obstacles in improving the quality of education, because most of them are 99% owned by foundations. Of the 216 ECDs and PNFs, only one has state or government-owned status. The condition of PAUD which is managed by the private sector, the head of the AL-ALIM education unit consists of 2 play groups aged 2-4 years and ages 5-6 years.

Opportunities for student for early childhood moral and mental development and parenting patterns do not distinguish between men and women. To group B who will continue their higher education, advice is given about new friends in elementary school and you all need to be ready to be independent.

Table 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Elements</th>
<th>Public Kindergarten (TKN)</th>
<th>Private Kindergarten</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>Civil Servants</td>
<td>Foundation Employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Headmaster &amp; Teacher</td>
<td>Local Government</td>
<td>Foundation Owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Access to Child Development</td>
<td>No constraints</td>
<td>No constraints</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Access to funds</td>
<td>Local Government</td>
<td>Foundation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Head of Education Unit, 2023
The head of the education unit stated that parenting does not discriminate between male and female students. We prepare mentally since entering this PAUD school, prepare students mentally so that later when they want to enter elementary school they are not afraid.

4.3 THE THIRD TARGET IS EQUAL ACCESS FOR ALL WOMEN AND MEN TO QUALITY AND AFFORDABLE EDUCATION

Equal access for all women and men to quality and affordable education has been carried out by several schools in the city of Probolinggo. This condition can be described by the following informant.

The head of the education unit stated that the school has opened equal access for all women and men to quality and affordable. We have almost the same number of female and male students.
This statement was also experienced by a teacher stating that our school does not discriminate between female and male students, all are treated equally and the acceptance of new students based on merit and from families is not economically disadvantaged.

4.4 THE FOURTH TARGET OF THE ENTREPRENEURSHIP-ORIENTED CURRICULUM

At this time, schools began implementing the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology policy Number 56 of 2022 (Permendikbudristek No. 56/2022) concerning Guidelines for Curriculum Implementation in the context of Learning Recovery, or the government enacted the Independent Learning Curriculum (KMB), as a replacement for the 2013 Curriculum. Because the curriculum is oriented towards entrepreneurship, the learning process inside and outside the school. This condition has been described by informants as follows:

The Head of the Education Office stated that the quality of education in schools has a standard, let alone has implemented an independent curriculum. The Secretary of the Education Office stated that the implementation of the independent curriculum policy aims at outstanding students, but there are constraints on teachers. The headmaster being responsible for the successful implementation of the independent curriculum has been optimal in directing teachers, but it all comes back to teachers to improve the quality of education in schools. Another opinion from the head of the education unit stated that our school in the learning process refers to KMB. There are three choices for independent learning, namely: independent change, independent learning and independent sharing. Our school chose to change independently, with the way teachers took the Ministry of Education and Culture's materials. Improving the quality of
education is also carried out in schools, with activities outside the classroom to motivate entrepreneurship to students by utilizing the garden behind the school.

4.5 TARGET KE-8 MEMBANGUN DAN MENINGKATKAN MUTU FASILITAS PENDIDIKAN YANG SENSITIF TERHADAP GENDER, ANAK, DISABILITAS DAN MENYEDIAKAN LINGKUNGAN BELAJAR YANG AMAN, TANPA KEKERASAN, INKLUSIF DAN EFEKTIF BAGI SEMUA

In general, schools with the help of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) Forum provide educational facilities by taking into account the needs of male and female students, disability and inclusive. Further it can be described by the informant as follows:

Officials of the regional planning and development agency stated that the business world and the industrial world have formed a CSR forum to assist education units with the needs of school facilities and infrastructure. The forum at least 2 times a year holds meetings to monitor and evaluate the effectiveness of granting to education units. City education board officials organized the Public Service-Oriented School-Based Management Awards, as a forum to show the achievements of each education unit in quality education management and award to the business world and the industrial world that have contributed to improving facilities and infrastructure to support quality education. Education officials stated that gender-sensitive education has been conducted with gender-sensitive, child-sensitive and disability-sensitive materials. In addition, it provides a safe, non-violent, inclusive and effective learning environment. The results of this activity have an impact on the increasing concern of students and teachers for the school environment and the community around the school.

4.6 THE NINTH TARGET IS PROVIDING SCHOLARSHIPS TO STUDENTS AND TRAINING

Scholarships are only given to students from poor families, because schools have received school operating costs (BOS) from the central government and regional school operating cost grants (BOSDA) from the local government. Here's an overview of the informant, as follows:

Officials from the education office in basic education stated that all students from poor families received scholarships, both from the government and the private sector. This is because the school has obtained BOS. One of the heads of the education unit stated that we had distributed scholarships. This year there were 56 male students and 48 female students for economically disadvantaged families. One of the school committee members representing the community, parents and students stated that the school had conducted student training in materials, namely: educator training and peer counseling,
healthy internet, orderly traffic, drug dangers, honesty canteen, democracy in schools, adolescent health, and weaving.

4.7 THE TENTH TARGET OF THE FOURTH GOAL OF THE SDGS IS TO IMPROVE THE PROVISION OF QUALIFIED TEACHERS, INCLUDING THROUGH INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION FOR TEACHER TRAINING

The provision of qualified teachers is affected by the lack of equitable distribution of teachers in some schools. The factor of not wanting to move is a factor that makes it difficult for the agency, so that the mutation of teachers between schools is affected. The education office trains teachers, either organized by the agency itself or from a third party and sends teachers to attend training out of town. International cooperation has also been carried out with the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) and the Asian Development Bank (ADB). This condition can be described by informants as follows:

Officials of the education office in the field of energy stated that they had trained teachers in the learning and teaching process, carried out teacher mutations both at their own request and the needs of teachers in schools, arranged proposals for teacher promotions. The head of the education office said that the collaboration with USAID with the good governance program with a focus on planning and budgeting and ADB with the improving public service program has trained teachers, principals, school committees and class groups in managing classes and preparing school work plans. One of the heads of the education unit stated that there were obstacles in our school, the quality of teachers transferred by the education office was below the quality of teachers who left school. Because we hope that if we will mutate a teacher, at least "rembug" between stakeholders in the field of education. Another head of the education unit stated that improving the quality of education was also carried out in schools, with activities outside the classroom.

4.8 COORDINATION CONSTRAINTS

Coordination constraints that often occur when schools do not know if there is a teacher mutation from one school to another and include information on retired teachers. The impact of this sudden transfer of teachers is that the school lacks teachers, so there is a delay in the teaching and learning process, because teachers teach many classes. This condition is as described by the informant below.

Officials from the education office for personnel stated that the department was struggling with teacher shortages, because it was not easy to appoint new teachers. This is because there has been no acceptance of new teachers from the central government.
and on the other hand local governments are not allowed to appoint honorary teachers. Thus, the transfer of teachers is prioritized by schools lacking teachers quantitatively and schools with many teachers are required to manage their own teacher shortage problems because they are transferred to other schools that are more in need. The agency admits that it is sometimes perceived by schools that there is no coordination, even though the agency moves quickly so that schools with teacher shortages are immediately addressed. The head of the education unit stated that the coordination problem of teacher transfer was an obstacle, because our school lacked teachers, for example religious teachers and civic education teachers and this resulted in a decrease in the quality of learning outcomes, because they should have been able to learn lessons every week. Officials from the education office for personnel stated that the department was struggling with teacher shortages, because it was not easy to appoint new teachers. This is because there has been no acceptance of new teachers from the central government and on the other hand local governments are not allowed to appoint honorary teachers. Thus, the transfer of teachers is prioritized by schools lacking teachers quantitatively and schools with many teachers are required to manage their own teacher shortage problems because they are transferred to other schools that are more in need. The agency admits that it is sometimes perceived by schools that there is no coordination, even though the agency moves quickly so that schools with teacher shortages are immediately addressed. The head of the education unit stated that the coordination problem of teacher transfer was an obstacle, because our school lacked teachers, for example religious teachers and civic education teachers and this resulted in a decrease in the quality of learning outcomes, because they should have been able to learn lessons every week.

4.9 SUMMARY OF THE FINDINGS

The findings of this study are that student learning outcomes increase, dropout rates can be reduced to near zero; early childhood development and parenting patterns have demonstrated readiness for primary school; there is equality of women and men to quality education; the curriculum is still poorly oriented towards entrepreneurship; has been built and there is an improvement in the quality of gender-responsive education facilities and the provision of an adequate learning environment; provision of scholarships that are right on target; and an increase in the provision of qualified teachers. As for visually, it can be seen in Figure 1 below.
Attentio to Figure 1 above where as an ordinate that the achievement of the highest target is the third target and the ninth target is 95% and the lowest is the achievement of the tenth target which is 80%. In addition to the findings above, it was found that the obstacle in achieving quality education targets was the lack of coordination between agencies and schools in teacher mutations between schools.

5 DISCUSSION

5.1 COMMUNICATION ASPECT

The role of communication between principals, teachers, students and parents has a vital role in achieving student learning outcomes targets and avoiding students dropping out. This is in accordance with Personal findings (2017); Safitri et al. (2022). Several schools in Indonesia have adopted Education for Sustainable Development (EfSD), a concept about their learning process (Hafizah Ghany, 2018). Findings on coordination constraints that often occur, between agencies and schools, so as to impact quality education, Syafrizal et al. (2023); Pradhana (2017).
There are constraints in synchronizing information about the real needs of school facilities and infrastructure, the principle that the right people are in the right place in the organization has not been implemented, and there is still low management of information and communication technology and discipline cannot be applied properly in service, weak equipment capabilities, this condition is exacerbated by the lack of operating vehicles that have an impact on suboptimal performance (Kusuma et al., 2021; Kustari et al., 2021; Firmansyah et al. (2022).

5.2 RESOURCES ASPECT

Every institution needs human resources as implementors and budget resources that can ensure the implementation of policies is carried out properly. The second target of access to early childhood development and pre-primary care and education towards primary education, Hardiyanti (2020) provides an overview of how understanding the first year of life can affect the quality of childcare and optimize early childhood development. Budget resources make a difference in the governance of public and private schools, as it will affect the quality of education in public and private schools. The 9th target is providing scholarships to students and training, only given to students from poor families (Hambali, 2021). The tenth target of SDGs on improving the provision of quality teachers, including through international cooperation (USAID, ADB); Jeffrey et al. (2022). The provision of qualified teachers is influenced by the lack of equitable distribution of teachers in schools Simbolon et al., 2022; Fitriyah and Santos (2020); Wardhani and Wijaya (2020).

5.3 DISPOSITION ASPECT

Disposition is the attitude and behavior of the policy implementor, meaning that implementing the policy effectively, the implementor must know the policy and be able to implement it. The behavior of teachers and students in the teaching and learning process has resulted in excellent achievements in achieving quality education targets. Guidance of teachers during early childhood development and upbringing and pre-primary education towards primary education. Achieving the 4th target of an entrepreneurship-oriented curriculum is relatively sufficient to change the behavior of learning in the classroom, changed to learning outside the classroom. This is in line with the findings of Kopnina (2016) related to
environmental utilization and protection, for the achievement of sustainable development goals related to environmental protection.

5.4 BUREAUCRACY STRUCTURE ASPECT

The bureaucratic structure is an aspect that can affect the success rate of the implementation of the last policy, so at this stage it needs to be prepared appropriately and correctly. Implementation of the Ministry of Education and Culture, Research and Technology policy Number 56 of 2022 concerning Guidelines for Curriculum Implementation in the context of Learning Recovery, or the government enforces the "Free Learning Curriculum" (KMB). The third target is that equal access for all women and men to quality education can be affordable. Educational facilities have taken into account the needs of both male and female students. There is a corporate social responsibility (CSR) forum paying attention to the needs of school facilities and infrastructure, Amalia et al., (2020); Andriani & Wakhudin (2020; Anas, 2021) uses e-learning as a learning tool. Equal opportunities for quality and affordable education for all women and men have been undertaken by the school, Yoshida et al. (2022).

5.5 IMPLICATION FOR THE POLICY

The fourth development goal of SDGs, namely quality education has been agreed by countries in the world in the 2016-2030 time period, has had a positive impact on the education sector at the international (global), national and local levels. Quality education will directly improve the human development index as the performance of local government officials who understand education, principals and teachers. Based on the achievement of the target of educational goals, the education office can formulate a policy to increase the achievement of the target at the level of 90% and below, namely: policies on improving learning outcomes, policies on accelerating the implementation of entrepreneurship-oriented curricula in schools and policies on coordination and synchronization between the education office and schools.

6 CONCLUSION

The implementation of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) policies in Indonesia, especially in Probolinggo City, East Java Province, has ensured inclusive and high-quality education and supported lifelong learning opportunities for all. However, public policy at the
implementation level requires coordination among actors in the education sector. This happens because local governments in developing countries, such as Indonesia, are not supported by adequate coordination and communication skills between parties. Thus, the improvement of quality education is less fast, especially early childhood education and extramural education.

Equality education at the local level is currently faced with obstacles in policy implementation. First, is the lack of understanding of local governments about Quality Education and Education for All, which has led to policy directions that are not focused on achieving the SDGs targets. Second, is the weak commitment of local governments to improve the quality of education, so that early childhood education and out-of-school education receive less attention in funding. Third, is the lack of effective implementation of the independent learning curriculum, so that the curriculum target is not optimally achieved. Fourth, lack of teacher resource planning, resulting in a lack of equitable distribution of qualified teachers and replacement teachers who retire in schools. Fifth, lack of coordination between the education and culture office and schools.

REFERENCES


Achieving Sustainable Quality Education Targets: a Case Study in East Java, Indonesia


